Online appendix for "Who Cares About Crackdowns? Exploring the Role of Trust in Individual Philanthropy"

Suparna Chaudhry
Lewis & Clark College
schaudhry@lclark.edu

Marc Dotson
Brigham Young University
marc_dotson@byu.edu

Andrew Heiss
Georgia State University
aheiss@gsu.edu

Contents

Model details

We analyze the effect of the various combinations of organizational features and donor characteristics with the following hierarchical Bayesian multinomial logit model:

$$\beta \sim \text{Multivariate } \mathcal{N}(Z\Gamma, \xi)$$
$$y \sim \text{Multinomial logit}(X\beta, \varepsilon)$$

where y = which alternative the respondent chooses to donate to, X = design matrix of attribute levels (i.e. organizations, issue areas, organizational practices, funding sources, and government relations), β = latent individual preferences for the attribute levels, Z = matrix of individual-level covariates (i.e. demographics, political knowledge, attitudes towards charity, etc.), Γ = matrix of coefficients mapping individual-level covariates onto the latent individual-level preferences, and ε and ξ = errors. Simply put, the first level of the model predicts individual donor preferences for various combinations of features (e.g. the combination of human rights issues, financial transparency, government funding, and government crackdown), while the second level of the model uses these fitted preferences to predict the ultimate choice of donation.

We collected many individual level covariates in our survey. To aid in analysis, we categorized these survey questions into five broader theoretical themes that include smaller groups of variables. Table A1 shows how we map individual survey questions to different groups. In this paper, we base our simulated market on a model that uses all individual characteristics in the first level:

$$\text{Donation preferences } (\beta) \sim \text{Multivariate } \mathcal{N}(Z\Gamma, \xi)$$

where:

$$Z\Gamma = \Gamma_a \text{Public affairs} + \Gamma_b \text{Political ideology} + \Gamma_c \text{Social views+}$$
$$\Gamma_d \text{Charity and voluntarism} + \Gamma_e \text{Demographics}$$

The alphabetic subscripts for the Γ coefficients here (i.e. Γ_a) represent multiple values, since broader categories like "Public affairs" comprise multiple variables, each with their own coefficients.

The second level of the model incorporates the β estimates from the first level and uses a design matrix of organizational characteristics:

$$\text{Donation choice } (y) \sim \text{Multinomial logit}(X\beta, \varepsilon)$$

where (count of distinct values included in parentheses):

$$X = \{\text{Organization (4), Issue area (4), Organizational practices (2),}$$
$$\text{Funding sources (3), Government relations (3)}\}$$

Table 1: Individual covariates used in Z to estmate the Γs in the first level of the model, or Multivariate $\mathcal{N}(Z\Gamma, \xi)$

Group	Survey question
Public affairs	
Public affairs knowledge	Q2.1: How often do you follow national news?
	Q2.2: How often do you follow international news?
	Q2.3: Which mediums do you use to follow news?
	Q2.4: How often would you say you follow what's going on in government and public affairs?
	Q5.7: Have you ever traveled to a developing country?
Public affairs activity	Q5.1: Did you vote in the last election?
Political ideology	
Ideology	Q5.2: 7-point scale on which the political views that people might hold are arranged from extremely liberal (left) to extremely conservative (right).
Social views	
Public affairs trust	Q5.6: 7-point scale of trust in political institutions and the state, arranged from no trust (left) to complete trust (right)
Social ideology	Q5.11: 7-point scale of agreement with statement "People should be more charitable towards others in society", from strongly agree (1) to strongly disagree (7)
Religiosity	Q5.8: How often do you attend religious or worship services, not including weddings and funerals?
	Q5.9: How important is religion in your life?
	Q5.10: What is your current religion, if any?
Charity and voluntarism	
Charity trust	Q2.7: How important is it that you trust a charity before giving to it?
	Q2.8: How much do you trust charities?
Charity activity	Q2.5: How often do you donate to charity?
	Q2.6: How much did you donate to charity last year?
Volunteer activity	Q2.9: Have you volunteered in the past 12 months?
	Q2.10: How often do you volunteer?
Activism activity	Q5.4: Historically, how involved have you been in activist causes?
	Q5.5: Historically, how involved has your family been in activist causes?
Association membership	Q5.3: List of possible types of organizations and associations
Demographics	
Gender	Q5.12: What is your gender?

Table 1: Individual covariates used in Z to estmate the Γs in the first level of the model, or Multivariate $\mathcal{N}(Z\Gamma, \xi)$ *(continued)*

Group	Survey question
Marital status	Q5.13: Are you now married, widowed, divorced, separated, or never married?
Education	Q5.14: What is the highest degree or level of school you have completed?
Income	Q5.15: What is your annual household income before taxes?
Race	Q5.16: Choose one or more races that you consider yourself to be:
Age	Q5.17: How old are you?

Survey experiment

Consent

Q1.1: You have been invited to participate in an academic research survey about international nongovernmental organizations. This study is being conducted by Author 1 from Institution 1 and Author 2 and Author 3 from Institution 2. If you qualify to complete the survey, it should take about **10 minutes** to complete.

Your participation in this study is entirely voluntary and you are free to skip any question or withdraw from the experiment at any time. You will not be asked to provide any personal information, and your answers will remain anonymous. There are no reasonably foreseeable risks or discomforts associated with participating in this study. **There will be questions designed to check that you're paying attention to the details of the experiment. If you answer these incorrectly, the survey will end early and you may not receive compensation.**

You will receive no direct benefits from participating in this research study.

If you have any questions at any time about the study or the procedures, you can contact Author 1 (author_1@example.com; Department 1, Institution 1, Address 1) or Author 2 (author_2@example.com; Department 2, Institution 2, Address 2). This research has been reviewed by the Institutional Review Board (IRB) at Institution 1 (IRB phone 1; IRB e-mail 1) and the IRB administrator at Institution 2 (IRB phone 2; IRB e-mail 2).

By clicking "Yes" below you are indicating that you are at least 18 years old, have read and understood this consent form and agree to participate in this research study. Please print a copy of this page for your records.

I have read the above information, and I consent to take part in the study. Single answer

- Yes
- No

Terminate if Q1.1 == "No"

First demographic section

Q2.1: How often do you follow national news? Single answer

- Multiple times a day
- Every day

- Once a week
- Hardly ever
- Never

Q2.2: How often do you follow international news? Single answer

- Always
- Sometimes
- Never

Q2.3: Which mediums do you use to follow news? (Select all that apply.) Multiple answers allowed

- TV
- Print
- Online (excluding social media)
- Social media
- Radio
- Email newsletters
- News app

Q2.4: Some people seem to follow what's going on in government and public affairs most of the time, whether there's an election going on or not. Others aren't that interested. How often would you say you follow what's going on in government and public affairs? Single answer

- Most of the time
- Some of the time
- Only now and then
- Hardly at all

Q2.5: How often do you donate to charity (with either cash or in-kind)? Single answer

- Once a week
- Once a month
- Once every three months
- Once every six months
- Once a year
- Once every few years
- Never

Terminate if Q2.5 == "Once every few years" OR Q2.5 == "Never"

Q2.6: How much did you donate to charity last year? Single answer

- $1 to $49
- $50 to $99
- $100 to $499
- $500 to $999
- $1000 to $4,999
- $5000 to $9,999
- $10,000 or more

Q2.7: On a scale of not at all important (1) to essential (7), how important is it for you to trust charities? Single answer

- 1 (Not at all important)
- 2
- 3
- 4
- 5
- 6
- 7 (Essential)

Q2.8: On a scale of no trust at all (1) to complete trust (7), how much do you trust charities? Single answer

- 1 (No trust at all)
- 2
- 3
- 4
- 5
- 6
- 7 (Complete trust)

Q2.9: Have you volunteered in the past 12 months? Single answer

- Yes
- No

Display Q2.10 if Q2.9 == "Yes"

Q2.10: How often do you volunteer? Single answer

- Once a week
- Once a month
- Once every three months
- Once every six months
- Once a year
- Once every few years

Q2.11: Please select blue from the following list: Single answer

- Red
- Yellow
- Blue
- Green

Terminate if Q2.11 != "Blue"

Conjoint explanation

Q3.1: In the following set of questions, we will ask you to select organizations you would donate to. The following terms will be important. Please read through this list carefully.

Organizations:

- *Amnesty International*: A London-based non-governmental organization known for its focus on human rights.
- *Greenpeace*: An independent, nonprofit, global campaigning organization known for using non-violent, creative confrontation to expose global environmental problems and their causes.
- *Oxfam*: An international group known for providing help to poor countries and disaster areas, with a focus on helping create lasting solutions to the injustice of poverty.
- *Red Cross*: An international organization known for caring for the wounded, sick, and homeless in wartime and following natural disasters.

Issue areas:

- *Emergency response*: Respond to situations that pose an immediate risk to health, life, property, or the environment.
- *Environment*: Protecting the natural world and the impact of human activity on its condition.

- *Human rights*: Protect the inalienable fundamental rights to which a person is inherently entitled simply because he or she is a human being.
- *Refugee relief*: Provide relief for those who have been forced to flee his or her country because of persecution, war or violence.

Organizational practices:

- *Financial transparency*: Organization discloses information regarding its donations and financial allocations in a timely and reliable manner.
- *Accountability*: Organization undergoes a regular third-party audit to ensure that it is meeting its program goals and obligations.

Funding sources:

- *Funded primarily by many small private donations*: Funds by individuals who make small independent contributions.
- *Funded primarily by a handful of wealthy private donors*: Funds by wealthy individuals or families, who receive tax deductions for donations.
- *Funded primarily by government grants*: Non-repayable funds gifted by a government department.

Relationship with host government:

- *Friendly relationship with government*: Organization has a friendly relationship with its host government.
- *Criticized by government*: Organization faces public condemnation from the government.
- *Under government crackdown*: Host government has undertaken official action to limit or stop the organization.

Q3.2: For each of the next 12 questions, imagine you are selecting an organization you will donate to and that each of the listed organizations exists.

Conjoint questions

Q4.1–12: Which of the following organizations would you donate to? Single option or "none" selected

	Option 1	Option 2	Option 3	None
Organization	Random	Random	Random	—
Issue area	Random	Random	Random	—
Financial transparency	Random	Random	Random	—
Accountability	Random	Random	Random	—
Funding sources	Random	Random	Random	—
Relationship with host government	Random	Random	Random	—

Additional demographic questions

Q5.1: Did you vote in the last election? Single answer

- Yes
- No

Q5.2: On a scale of extremely liberal (1) to extremely conservative (7), how would you describe your political views? Single answer

- 1 (Extremely liberal)
- 2
- 3
- 4
- 5
- 6
- 7 (Extremely conservative)

Q5.3: Here is a list of different types of voluntary organizations. For each organization, indicate whether you are an active member, an inactive member, or not a member of that type of organization: Matrix table

	Active member	Inactive member	Don't belong
Church or religious organization	•	•	•
Sport or recreational organization	•	•	•
Art, music, or educational organization	•	•	•
Labor union	•	•	•
Political party	•	•	•
Environmental organization	•	•	•
Professional association	•	•	•
Humanitarian or charitable organization	•	•	•
Consumer organization	•	•	•
Other organization	•	•	•

Q5.4: Historically, how involved have you been in activist causes? Single answer

- Extremely involved
- Very involved
- Moderately involved
- Slightly involved
- Never involved

Q5.5: Historically, how involved has your family been in activist causes? Single answer

- Extremely involved
- Very involved
- Moderately involved
- Slightly involved
- Never involved

Q5.6: On a scale of no trust (1) to complete trust (7), how much do you trust political institutions and the state? Single answer

- 1 (No trust)
- 2
- 3
- 4
- 5
- 6
- 7 (Complete trust)

Q5.7: Have you ever traveled to a developing country? Single answer

- Yes
- No

Q5.8: How often do you attend religious or worship services, not including weddings and funerals? Single answer

- More than once a week
- Once a week
- Once or twice a month
- A few times a year
- Seldom

- Never
- Don't know

Q5.9: How important is religion in your life? Single answer

- Extremely important
- Very important
- Moderately important
- Slightly important
- Not at all important

Q5.10: What is your current religion, if any? Single answer

- Catholic (including Roman Catholic and Orthodox)
- Protestant (United Church of Canada, Anglican, Orthodox, Baptist, Lutheran)
- Christian Orthodox
- Jewish
- Muslim
- Sikh
- Hindu
- Buddhist
- Atheist (do not believe in God)
- Other: _____

Q5.11: On a scale of strongly agree (1) to strongly disagree (7), rate your response to the following statement: People should be more charitable towards others in society. Single answer

- 1 (Strongly agree)
- 2
- 3
- 4
- 5
- 6
- 7 (Strongly disagree)

Q5.12: What is your gender? Single answer

- Male
- Female
- Transgender

- Prefer not to say
- Other: _____

Q5.13: Are you now married, widowed, divorced, separated, or never married? Single answer

- Married
- Widowed
- Divorced
- Separated
- Never married

Q5.14: What is the highest degree or level of school you have completed? Single answer

- Less than high school
- High school graduate
- Some college
- 2 year degree
- 4 year degree
- Graduate or professional degree
- Doctorate

Q5.15: What is your annual household income before taxes? Single answer

- Less than $10,000
- $10,000 to $19,999
- $20,000 to $29,999
- $30,000 to $39,999
- $40,000 to $49,999
- $50,000 to $59,999
- $60,000 to $69,999
- $70,000 to $79,999
- $80,000 to $89,999
- $90,000 to $99,999
- $100,000 to $149,999
- $150,000 to $199,999
- $200,000 to $299,999
- $300,000 or more

Q5.16: Choose one or more races that you consider yourself to be: Multiple answers allowed

- White
- Black or African American
- American Indian or Alaska Native
- Asian
- Native Hawaiian or Pacific Islander
- Other: _____

Q5.17: How old are you? Single answer

- Under 18
- 18 – 24
- 25 – 34
- 35 – 44
- 45 – 54
- 55 – 64
- 65 – 74
- 75 – 84
- 85 or older

Q5.18: What is your ZIP code? Text field